

REP ID	FULL NAME	ORGANISATION DETAILS	COMMENT ID	MAIN MODIFICATION REF/ DOCUMENT REF	LP POLICY	PARA / DIAGRAM/ SITE	COMMENT SUMMARY	RESPONSE
MCC/004	Joe Ctori	Marrons obo Clarendon Land Development	H1	EXAM58L/ PC14			Almost certain the Council will not be able to demonstrate a 5 year supply on adoption. Recommend amendment to Cossington limits at the eastern boundary of HA59 to the railway line to provide additional land for housing to support 5YHLS.	No comment on these matters - discussed at hearing sessions.
MMC/006	Angela Brooks	Fisher German obo DWH	H2	EXAM 58L			5YHLS not robust. Marginal under Sedgfield method. Liverpool Method not appropriate. Consider that Liverpool only acceptable where time to be allowed for strategic sites to come on stream yet in CBC three SUEs been allocated for significant time and delivering or close to delivering.	
MMC/006	Angela Brooks	Fisher German obo DWH	H3	EXAM 58J			trajectory unduly optimistic, small changes will lead to sub 5YHLS. Specific related comments on 3 SUE	
MMC/006	Angela Brooks	Fisher German obo DWH	H4	EXAM 58J	LUC2		Loughborough West - 250 dpa not justified, 2 Reserved Matter approvals. Delivery rates may decrease in coming years.	
MMC/006	Angela Brooks	Fisher German obo DWH	H5	EXAM 58J	LUA2		North East of Leicester SUE - 3 Reserved Matters approvals, highway constraints with no clear evidence as to when work to create more capacity will be complete, not when additional RM applications will be submitted and determined. Written agreement between council and landowner not sufficient evidence. Potentially reduced annual delivery.	
MMC/006	Angela Brooks	Fisher German obo DWH	H6	EXAM 58J	LUA3		Birstall North preparatory works well advanced but no delivery yet, anticipated 106 dwellings this year, 191 next, and 222 the year after. Not supported by evidence. Storn argument to reduce supply from this by 700 to the 300 with detailed permission.	
MMC/015	Sam Gale/ John Kirby	Lichfields obo St Philips Land Ltd	H7	EXAM58K	DS3(HA49)	HA49	Trajectory for HA49 should be updated to : 2027/28. 68 dwellings. 2028/29. 105. 2029/30. 52. 2030/31. 35.	
MMC/023	Sophie Trough	Pegasus obo Davidsons	H8	EXAM 58J	DS3 (HA43)	HA43	Trajectory is realistic.	
MMC/023	Sophie Trough	Pegasus obo Davidsons	H9	EXAM58L			5 year housing land supply is marginal. Important that CBC continues to be required to demonstrate an annual supply. Examination of this plan is under September 2023 NPPF and the provisions in December 2023 NPPF are intended to be removed.	
MMC/024	Phoebe Conway	Marrons obo Richborough, William Davis & Bowler Family	H10	EXAM58J	DS3 (HA15)	HA15	lack of progress on PPA and Pre app means we cannot guarantee delivery in line with the trajectory.	

REP ID	FULL NAME	ORGANISATION DETAILS	COMMENT ID	MAIN MODIFICATION REF/ DOCUMENT REF	LP POLICY	PARA / DIAGRAM/ SITE	COMMENT SUMMARY	RESPONSE
MMC/024	Phoebe Conway	Marrons obo Richborough, William Davis & Bowler Family	H11	EXAM58J	DS3 (HA15)	HA15	note a ransom strip on planning application for north eastern component of HA15 by Miller Homes [P/23/1635/2] concern regarding ability to deliver site.	
MMC/024	Phoebe Conway	Marrons obo Richborough, William Davis & Bowler Family	H12	EXAM58L			Concern regarding marginal 5 Year housing land supply, and question this and therefore the 5 year supply on adoption.	
MMC/026	Phoebe Conway	Marrons on behalf of Hallam Land	H13	EXAM58J	DS3 (HA64)	HA64	now impossible for 40 homes to be delivered on site in 2027/28.Suggest push back a full monitoring year, removing 40 homes from 5 year supply.	
MMC/026	Phoebe Conway	Marrons on behalf of Hallam Land	H14	EXAM58L			Concern regarding marginal 5 Year housing land supply, and question this and therefore the 5 year supply on adoption.	
MMC/030	Daniel Robinson-Wells	Marrons obo William Davis Homes & Roythornes Trustees	H15	EXAM 58J	DS3(HA32)	HA32	agree with trajectory regarding first completions and delivery rate but should be amended to reflect 350 units. First completions reliant on determination of outline pp 2024/25, Reserved Matters and discharge of pre commencement conditions in 2025/26	
MMC/035	Clare Clarke	Pegasus obo Taylor Wimpey UK & Merton College Oxford	H16	EXAM58J			Housing trajectory is correct for HA1 and HA3	
MMC/040	John Goodall	DLP Planning Ltd obo Lagan Homes	H17	EXAM57B	5YHLS		EXAM57B (Note on Selection of Sites for Option 2) simply reinforces these objections (that the conclusions of the SA cannot be supported). Page 4 of the documents confirms that it was necessary to reconsider small sites with at least one 'Scenario X' as part of this scenario option. Our client's site at Gorse Hill (PSH002) would satisfy the criterion for considering additional sites (notwithstanding the overarching objection that ecological constraints are not a reason to exclude the site from assessment in any event). Proposing a 50 dwelling limit on 'small sites' has no basis in national policy. Council has failed to take account developers proposals through P/22/2132/2 to provide development on a reduced area equivalent to less than 50 dwellings.	

REP ID	FULL NAME	ORGANISATION DETAILS	COMMENT ID	MAIN MODIFICATION REF/ DOCUMENT REF	LP POLICY	PARA / DIAGRAM/ SITE	COMMENT SUMMARY	RESPONSE
MMC/040	John Goodall	DLP Planning Ltd obo Lagan Homes	H18	5YHLS	EXAM58L		Construction activity recorded in Charnwood in 2023/24 exists in freefall with a deterioration far worse than the national average. These issues are only compounded further by the Plan only making provision for a plan period of less than 13 years on adoption. Extension of the Plan Period would provide reasons to select sites providing further choice and flexibility and not necessarily those developable sites limited to delivery beyond year 6-15+.	
MMC/043	Alasdair Thorne	Marrons obo Bellway Homes	H19	EXAM85J		HA7	expected to start on site in Spring 2028 but due to delays in determining applications should push start on site back a monitoring year . regardless of delays unlikely to complete 40 homes in 2028/29. removing 40 units from the first five years supply on adoption	
MMC/043	Alasdair Thorne	Marrons obo Bellway Homes	H20	EXAM85L			raise concerns if 5.01 years supply is determined sufficient to meet the NPPF requirement.	
MCC/044	Alasdair Thorne	Marrons obo Ashberry Strategic Land	H21	EXAM58L 5YHLS		HA59	Timely determination of P/23/0226/2 is needed if the site (HA59) was to deliver in accordance with EXAM58J and support the marginal housing land supply position of 5.01 years detailed within EXAM 58L. Realistically, the application will need to be reported to a plans committee by the Autumn if delivery continues to be anticipated for 2027/28.	
MMC/046	Alasdair Thorne	Marrons obo Richborough	H22	EXAM58J			Diagree with trajectory and expect delivery for HA39 to start in 2029.	
MMC/047	David Bainbridge	Savills obo Redrow	H23	EXAM58L			Marginal supply , critical of delivery.	
MMC/047	David Bainbridge	Savills obo Redrow	H24	EXAM58J-M			a number of assumptions in 58J are out of date or overly positive, based on evidence from 2022 or update at hearings at the beginning of 2024. They provide a spreadsheet comparing them.	
MMC/047	David Bainbridge	Savills obo Redrow	H25	EXAM58J			Comparing EXAM58J to EXAM11, 61 of 72 sites been subject to delay of avearge 2.4 years, remaining 11 delivered roughly as expected or (3) bought forward by 1-2 years. Little or no evidence to support change to this pattern. Latest evidence shows delays greater in magnitude. Question the windfall allowance. Insufficient evidence to show increases in numbers are achievable, cite an application refused on housing mix.	

REP ID	FULL NAME	ORGANISATION DETAILS	COMMENT ID	MAIN MODIFICATION REF/ DOCUMENT REF	LP POLICY	PARA / DIAGRAM/ SITE	COMMENT SUMMARY	RESPONSE
MMC/048	Helena Taylor	RPS obo Redrow, Davidsons, & Helen Jean Cope Charity	H26	EXAM58M 5YHLS			There are 16 sites within the existing supply (EXAM 58M) where we dispute the deliverability assumptions put forward by the Council. The full assessment is set out in Appendix 1 of the report. Our assessment includes a review of the sustainable urban extensions in the adopted Core Strategy, in particular North East of Leicester (LUA2) and West of Loughborough (LUC2); both of which have planning permission. Whilst we accept these two SUEs remain deliverable in principle, we nonetheless contend that the delivery assumptions are in all cases overoptimistic and should be revised downwards. The supply position in Charnwood on adoption would therefore range between 3.49 – 3.63 years when the shortfall is dealt with over the next five years (the 'Sedgefield' method), (the correct method as per the NPPG) and between 3.92 – 4.07 years when the shortfall is spread over the remainder of the plan period.	
MMC/048	Helena Taylor	RPS obo Redrow, Davidsons, & Helen Jean Cope Charity	H27	EXAM58L 5YHLS			As acknowledged by CBC in Exam 58L, a shortfall exists of 1,293 dwellings delivered against the housing requirement since the start of the Plan period. The PPG is very clear that any shortfall should be addressed in the first five years, i.e. via the Sedgefield Method, rather than over the Plan period, i.e. via the Liverpool method. The Council in their updated documentation have not provided any justification for using the Liverpool method, and therefore the soundness of the Plan should be assessed in the context of the Sedgefield method, in addition to any consideration of past delivery in future supply assessments. A modification to this effect should be made accordingly. This should be updated to identify the Watermead Lane site in full as an additional allocation, with Phases 1 and 2 distinguished for early delivery opportunities.	
MMC/048	Helena Taylor	RPS obo Redrow, Davidsons, & Helen Jean Cope Charity	H28	EXAM58M 5YHLS			Omission Site - Housing Land Supply Update- This should be updated to identify Watermead Lane, Loughborough in full as an additional allocation, with Phases 1 and 2 distinguished for early delivery opportunities.	

REP ID	FULL NAME	ORGANISATION DETAILS	COMMENT ID	MAIN MODIFICATION REF/ DOCUMENT REF	LP POLICY	PARA / DIAGRAM/ SITE	COMMENT SUMMARY	RESPONSE
MMC/048	Helena Taylor	RPS obo Redrow, Davidsons, & Helen Jean Cope Charity	H29	EXAM58J 5YHLS			Omission site - As well as including Watermeand Lane in the Housing Land Supply Update, it should also included in the Housing Land Supply Trajectory. This should be amended to reflect Phases 1 and 2 (combined residential capacity of 270 dwellings) at Watermead Lane available to be delivered within the first five years. The remaining residential dwellings (330) in Phases 3 and 4 should be distributed for delivery across the following three to four years.	
MMC/049	Tim Evans	Avison Young obo Jelson Homes	H30	EXAM 58J-M			EXAM 58J-M do not contain any information to support or explain the assumptions it has made and to justify the number of homes it is asserting will be delivered in the first five years after adoption of the Plan. Assumptions appear to be only based on site proformas and / or Statements of Common Ground that promoters / developers of each of the allocated sites completed in March 2022 together with updated information on the delivery trajectories for certain sites which the promoters provided to the Council during the early part of the 2024 (or during the Hearing Sessions). This falls significantly short of the level of detailed evidence and scrutiny on deliverability required by the NPPF. Trajectories alone are unreliable, evidenced by the level of slippage across the board between the 2022 and 2024 estimates. Council's failure to provide clear evidence that sites will deliver new homes in the 5 year period post-adoption is a critical omission and one that makes it impossible for the Inspectors to reach robust, justified conclusions on the HLS issue.	
MMC/049	Tim Evans	Avison Young obo Jelson Homes	H31	EXAM 58J-M (continued)			Counsel Opinion sets out that the Plan will not provide for a five year housing land supply, for the purposes of NPPF 69a. AY has undertaken its own assessment of the Council's latest Housing Trajectory Updated, Housing Land Supply Site List and the evidence underpinning it, included at Appendix 2. Demonstrates serious issues with (i) the categorisation as 'deliverable' of some of the sites that it has included; (ii) assumptions that have been made about the number of dwellings that certain sites are able to accommodate; and, (iii) the lead in times and delivery rates that it has assumed. Rep lists a number of sites. Respondent has prepared its own LP housing trajectory (appendix 3) which shoes the LP will not have a 5YHLS on adoption.	

